

OPEN 2020 Mutual Credit – a deeper dive, a bigger splash!

Main Open 2020 pad at <https://pad.disroot.org/p/open2020>

Although Mutual Credit has a strong pedigree, both theoretical and practical, it cannot be said to have ‘moved the needle’ in terms of the world economy.

If we believe that mutual credit is important, that it holds a promise of deep systemic change to the incentives that dictate what sort of economy we can have, then we need to understand the reasons for this lack of wider impact.

This session will assume a certain degree of knowledge about mutual credit which will be explained in the introductory session on the 11th.

With Grace Rachmany as chair of the session we will hear from Enric Duran of Faircoin, Giuseppe Littera of Sardex, Ferananda from Holochain and members of the UK’s Open Credit Network discussing:

- Issues of Scale
- Issues of mass adoption
- The pull of ‘real money’
- Story telling vs tool building
- Managing trade imbalances, investment, assets, and assurance
- And the potential scope of a global network of mutual credit networks

If you’re interested in joining or starting a new economy currency project this session will provide you with a huge amount of background and an introduction to the projects at the cutting edge of the field.

Notes

Ferananda - social glue - trust - needs a champion...
need to think "it's not money" - when u go negative it's an opportunity to give - it's about flow
- being negative is alright! Don't think money - think community and relationships

Enric - 2010 - 2013 - communities in Cataluna with 17 or 20 social currencies

Dil - mutual credit is not a thing - the groups of people that come together around a process
Brixton LETS in the 90s created huge social connection - good friends / strangers and LETS
changed this - to a large acquaintanceship.... People were connected to tens of thousands of
others

negative: people comitt - but had bad experiences - e.g. the only plumber went +1000 units
and had too much reiki so had to stop trading - this was a hard things for him having trusted
the group / network... we have to be aware of this - if there is going to be economic value in
the network they have to commit

Grace - money / social cohesion - returning it to us - which has been taken away by fiat
money...

As long as u have to pay taxes in fiat... Is there a limit?

Peppe: The different nature of these schemes - one thing is the baby. sitting circle = care economy
can be self -sustaining - if u find a good balance between those that give and receive
incomplete supply and demand matching

The plumber - people exchanging on a community centered, stateless basis
when the plumber does £1000 worth of plumbing - that's a taxable income
This is nothing new - like Crypto is nothing new -
The supplier of the plumber has to source equipment somewhere - is it produced locally?
Nott in Sardinia - it's imported - so tax issues - supply chain issues...
We try to be a bridge between the plumber and the regulators... and uni professors - but these
are real hurdles
biggest hurdle = not someone asking you to pay a debt ... mutual credit = mutual risk...
how do we agree on how to deal NOT with the good side... but how to go UP when you're
down...

Dil says there are a lot of fully mutual networks, the Open Credit Network looked at Sardex,
but briefly what we managed to design was a simple design that every member has a vote,
but the management of the scheme is contracted out to a small team. If members don't like it
they can vote in a different admin team. That mechanism is not tried and tested, they haven't
yet had a crisis, but they've tried to address the issue of structure.

Giuseppe says that in Sardex they have always been aware of governance issues, but the they
are governed by contracts with the members. Also for us, impact is more important than
governance. There will be conflicts with 5,000 members, agreements are regularly updated
based on feedback from the community. So now there is a "fair usage" policy. If people
don't like the rules they can always opt out. They have to pay their balance and there is a
debt collection process. We won't get any mainstream adoption if these concepts are not
grasped. People are self-employed 90% don't report .

Closing round: Dil says "if we wish to build a viable new economy we must provide tools
which give people freedom as in the main economy, but also has value creation." -
"Capitalism works by providing a pathway, we have to provide a pathway that leads away
from the destructive economy (approximately).

Enric says we need the technology to be flexible so that the system can be changed.
Decentralised models need to be more flexible and appropriate to human groups.

Ferananda says we need to be creative and think beyond wealth, and experiment, with
different models - there's a world that mutual credit can do beyond goods & n services.

Matslats says a lot of us have it in mind that we can create an alternative that will replace
capitalism, but he says capitalism is failing and the best we can do is to be there as it falls, to
catch people - that takes the pressure of us, we have to keep on doing our stuff until our
moment comes.

Sue Bell says her reality is that she is neuro-diverse - she is here to capture the enormous
wealth and put the jigsaw together in a new way. Not helpful, but hopeful. Conversation she
has been hearing over the decades has more clarity, heartfelt but not fantasy-land.

[11:24] PUBLIC_CHAT_CLEAR

[11:24] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : pad for notes: https://pad.disroot.org/p/Mutual_Credit_deep_dive

please do help take notes!

bi

Billy Smith

11:19 AM

Renata: the small print matters...

ol

Oliver Sylvester-Bradley

11:19 AM

(you can hide the presentation by minimising it with the small blue button at the top right of the presentation)

bi

Billy Smith

11:20 AM

Also, the Thingiverse debacle was an example of a community that was being run on a corporate platform, which meant that it was vulnerable to changes in ownership.

ol

Oliver Sylvester-Bradley

11:20 AM

(Matt - your mic is a bit loud)

mi

mike hales

11:23 AM

"who ultimately owns what" - does someone know the answer to this, for The Social Change Agency? Website seems to say nothing on governance. It's a great organisation, would be good to understand the governance.

mo

Mothiur Rahman

11:23 AM

interesting Billy about Thingiverse - seems to still exist? Any articles you know about the "debacle" ?<https://www.makerbot.com/thingiverse/>

bi

Billy Smith

11:23 AM

the economic incentives aren't there for the system to be changed

[11:25] Billy Smith : Mother: The more community-minded founders were squeezed out, and then it was sold to Stratasys, who immediately changed the T&C's, so they could monetise the hardware designs without paying the designers.

[11:26] Renata Ballesteros : What community currency did Fernanda mention in Mexico?

[11:28] John Waters : Well put, Fernanda.

[11:28] Billy Smith : mothier: <https://techcrunch.com/2014/05/28/makerbot-responds-to-critics-who-claim-it-is-stealing-community-ip/> :(

[11:28] Renata Ballesteros : *clap clap clap clap*

[11:28] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : +1

[11:30] Mothiur Rahman : Thanks Bill - so in terms of the "build/maintain/manage/defend" principle spoken about yesterday, Thingiverse at the very beginning, when the group didn't know whether it was going to be successful or not, should still have thought that through and put in "future proof" terms to their collaboration agreement for scenarios that would move away from those values bringing them together - e.g. "no changes shall be made to T&Cs without the consent of all founders"

[11:30] Billy Smith : https://reprap.org/wiki/Replicator_controversy :(

[11:31] Billy Smith : This is what i meant when i said that the "Defend" function should be built-in from the start.

[11:32] Billy Smith : It's also a side-effect of accepting VC-funding.

[11:32] LISTENONLY-Harith Kamarul : Hey all, I can't seem to connect to the audio. Tried multiple devices and it won't work 😊 will try a couple more times but if not will watch the recording later

[11:32] Jakub Lanc : Didn't catch why didn't it work for the plumber?

[11:32] Jakub Lanc : In the end?

[11:32] Billy Smith : try seeing if your audio is being used by another tab, or another application

[11:33] Aleeza Howitt : What Ferananda was saying about encouraging people to let go of the "scarcity mindset" is a really interesting point. One big thing I think well-designed "mutual credit" tech can do is change how people look at negative balances!

[11:33] Dave Darby : Jakub - everybody wanted his services, but he didn't have enough ways to spend his credits

[11:33] Ferananda : Jakub, probably because he didnt find anything he needed in the network.

[11:33] Guy James : Hi Jakub - the plumber ended up with more credits than he could use, basically.

[11:33] Jakub Lanc : @Gyu: Ah ok, thanks!

[11:33] Jakub Lanc : @Dave thanks

[11:34] Jakub Lanc : @Ferananda thanks :)

[11:34] Ferananda : Aleeza, if the tech can help change peoples hearts and minds then yes.

[11:35] Billy Smith : And he's still having to pay UK pounds for the parts he uses

[11:35] Wael Alsaad : Alternative currencies (or natural currencies) building conscious people connection that has impact, so they work on real missions when they interact, is releasing and make us integral human, sharing a common path of purpose touching new edges of co-creation . They are actually healing , but how to make them popular !?

[11:35] Aleeza Howitt : I do still think tech is only a small part of the picture though

[11:35] Ferananda : we have very embedded behaviors and that shouldnt be taken for granted. So its a yes AND you need to constantly catch the sneaky old patterns

[11:36] Ferananda : Aleeza, I agree

[11:36] Aleeza Howitt : Yeah :)

[11:36] Ferananda : Beautiful @wael

[11:36] Billy Smith : Any economy needs a godd basis of primary industries to be able to have a basic functionality.

[11:37] Mothiur Rahman : thanks Billy for the article - what if makerbot had patented the community design but any profit was shared by all users/producers/stakeholders - would this have been acceptable do you think? Ie its not profit making which is the problem but whether there is fair sharing?

[11:38] Simon Grant : I really appreciate Giuseppe's point there

[11:38] Billy Smith : Ish...

Some of the designs that were submitted were extensions of existing designs, so the people submitting them could not give the full rights to Thingiverse.

[11:39] Susannah Browning : Neoliberalism is about inserting the profit imperative into every human interaction. Consequently, I really dislike the transactional nature of human interaction, as altruism and reciprocity are so much purer than that. Mutual credit systems, by nature, widen the of transactional scope by bringing externalities into the accounting. Which is of course good, but my question is how we make sure this departs from the neoliberal operation of making the profit imperative central and inserting it into places it just shouldn't go? How do we insert the values at this point, to prevent mutual credit networks (potentially being usurped to or developing towards) furthering this neoliberal imperative? How do we preserve other values based imperatives within the system?

[11:40] Billy Smith : Having it running as a Thingiverse co-operative should be possible, but it hasn't been built yet.

[11:40] Mary Fee : Dil talked about the imbalance that developed in Brixton LETS - the plumber couldn't afford to continue taking a currency that he couldn't get value for.

Giuseppe is talking about positives of peer to pee, if you can find a good balance between the members. It's a movement that's being going on for ages, many different examples. From the plumber you need to go up to the supplier of the plumber - he has to source the equipment from somewhere, if not produced locally there's a problem. There is also the taxation issue. In Sardinia, what we are trying to do is to stimulate a dialogue between the stake-holders and it's really hard. The biggest problem is not someone knocking on the door asking you to repay, the hard bit is how do we as companies operating in a place agree on how to "go up".

[11:40] Aleeza Howitt : @Ferananda But I think the visual design of account balances etc in mutual credit can do a lot to change the way we think about money. It's way more important than people might think.

[11:40] Sam Peters : +1 to susannah's great question

[11:40] Leon : well said Giussepi

[11:41] Billy Smith : +1

[11:41] Andreas Fletcher - Trustlines : kids are no distraction

[11:41] Billy Smith : it makes the situation more human... :)

[11:41] Martin Dow : @channel - my apols for earlier distraction :-/

[11:41] Ferananda : @aleeza I could see that good dashboard with particular ways of seeing the flows can add a lot of value. Yes

[11:41] mike hales : Guiseppe is giving us a lovely example of the deep skill, capability and scope of the mutual sector organiser . . "Italk to the regulator, I talk in this community, I talk to the university professio" . . etc. Ester Foreman was the same :)) We have SUCH capabiliy. Mutualist capability

[11:41] Mary Fee : Grace says in the pandemic a lot of people are talking about local supply chains. But all of a sudden hey, maybe we are going to be operate between our mutual groups.

[11:42] Billy Smith : also, being child-friendly is more inclusive of parents, and women

[11:42] Simon Grant : Supply chains ... a well tried and tested economic development approach is import substitution. Develop a local business that can supply the things that are currently being imported. Again (as in many things) good quality, appropriate, timely information is vital.

[11:42] Andreas Fletcher - Trustlines : @billy agree

[11:42] Billy Smith : This also affects resilience

[11:43] Martin Dow : @aleeza @Ferananda

"visual design of account balances" Fascinating thought..

.. any experiences?

[11:43] Simon Grant : The point I'm really supporting from Giuseppe is that we need to be thinking of supply 'chains' not just individual businesses

[11:43] Billy Smith : One colleague was working on resilience plans for the Canary islands.

One of the issues that they had to deal with was the supply of insulin, as it was ALL imported from outside the islands.

[11:43] mike hales : "Spawning child networks" sounds a little like a principle that was at work in Social Change Agency - a service to support spawning-capability?

[11:44] Trevor Hilder : Federation is vital to scalability

[11:44] mike hales : "Every network created is a mutual"

[11:44] Simon Grant : @Billy and you probably know of the open insulin work

[11:44] Mary Fee : Dil is talking about the Credit Commons, how to connect between different groups - Tim Jenkins introduced the idea of a central exchange. Matthew introduced a protocol to enable any group to federate to a wider network and for any group to spawn a child network. The implementation of that which Dil and Matthew has been working on - they call it "Mutual Credit Clubs" enables a group to join a larger group without changing how they work internally, which is an exciting proposition. All members of these groups are co-creating them - there is no organisation at the centre, they are collaborations.

[11:44] Wael Alsaad : lets think about "extended locality" through including Diaspora has bound with local economies ! Or has solidarity with the locality. (solidarity economy)

Though we support decentralisation and commons structure

[11:44] Billy Smith : @Simon :D Yes! :D

[11:44] Ferananda : @susannah a person that went very deep into what you mention is Bernard Lietaer who argued that the monoculture of money is what creates economic instability, leading to liquidity crisis. He calls for a greater diversity of alternative currencies with what he called yin values versus yang.

[11:44] Billy Smith : yes :D

[11:45] Lauren Nignon : I am involved in interoperability

[11:45] Lauren Nignon : But not ready to jump in a discussion

[11:45] Renata Ballesteros : @Martin Dow - As a graphic designer, yes! Creating trust through visuals is crucial. It's why all these giant brands invest so much on it ;)

[11:45] Billy Smith : Lauren: what sort of work are you doing?

[11:45] Simon Grant : @Lauren please get in touch I've been in interoperability for ages!

[11:45] Billy Smith : ok

[11:46] Aleeza Howitt : @Martin @Ferananda @Renata It's one thing we're working on right now with Trustlines. I would LOVE to hear your thoughts on that, or anyone else here who has had relevant experiences

[11:47] Mary Fee : Leon is talking about a decentralised local "App Store". Creating a report every year with the University of Liverpool. The question is can they do a report every year - in due course to be eligible people have to have a sustainable supply chain - to introduce corporate responsibility reports that actually mean something.

[11:47] Renata Ballesteros : @Aleeza, would be thrilled!

[11:47] Gary Alexander : Great stuff, Leon. Yes, providers should be asked to provide regular reports on how sustainable they are, and also on how well they treat people - employees, suppliers, customers.

[11:47] Julie Collishaw : The library of things is a great resource and helps with placemaking

[11:48] Leon : exactly, our job is to bring customers and value , but then have enforceable working practices

[11:49] Jakub Lanc : @Aleeza: I agree that tackling the "debt" framing and associated connotations and the whole "felt sense" of it will be probably very important in gaining wider adoption.

I think Dil was doing a step towards that, when reframing it from "debt" to a "promise of providing value at some point", and all people knowing and accepting the fact, that promises sometime don't get kept, but knowing there's a goodwill, taking away the immediately felt burden of obligation & threat associated with "debt".

[11:49] Billy Smith : https://reprap.org/wiki/Replicator_controversy works on approaches to this

[11:49] Billy Smith : sorry, wrong link

[11:49] John Waters : The open money model provides a high-variety, recursively nested structure capable of supporting arbitrary currency types, but centred around individual agents ("stewards") rather than groups. Other structures can be provided at a meta-level.

Holonically-nested REA accounting.

[11:49] Mary Fee : Sue Bell said in her ward they have people who speak 56 different first languages. It would be great to bring them together but at the moment they are "socially cleansing" Brixton. But it's awe-inspiring - she is flowing along with it and hopes that something good will come of it. The main question is how do we get people to work together - in Monetary Reform they were arguing against each other. She hopes that in this context we will do better.

[11:49] Jakub Lanc : But it seems to me there's still space to explore and bring in more "towards" frame... somewhat inciting motivation to engage and participate vs. a sense of pressure.

[11:50] Billy Smith : <https://www.provenance.org/> works on this

[11:50] Susannah Browning : yes - hubs (though I hate the language here!)

[11:50] Mary Fee : Grace says in Brixton in multiple currencies there is a hopeful sign.

[11:50] Jakub Lanc : (When writing "towards" I mean it in the sense of approach / avoidance motivation distinction.)

[11:51] Dave Darby : John -- would like to talk with you more about this, and how to translate for a wider audience

[11:52] Mothiur Rahman : @susannah, in terms of alternative to the "profit imperative", I am seeing far more money/resources being sunk into alternative digital currencies that maintain the profit imperative - see Mattereum as an example. Sometimes it feels like battling against a tide with a tiny paddle

[11:52] Billy Smith : Think of things in terms of this map, http://resiliencemaps.org/simple_critical_infrastructure_maps.png

Each of the different levels of scale requires a different approach to get the most effective results.

What works on one scale, may not work effectively on a larger scale.

[11:52] Mary Fee : Enric is talking about experience in Catalonia where they had local communities which were confederated. We never pretended to be part of the mainstream economic system. There were different local experiences, and there was a lack of a common vision about where to go, so it was difficult to sustain it. It's easier to sustain a small group but with a larger system the human relations are more difficult to sustain.

[11:53] Wael Alsaad : you speak about decentralization as if we live in a free world .. in hostile political regions and corruption, dominating power will not let you be a champion of change, that's we need to backup real change-agents in these regions with global power. So we have to construct a global coalition ASAP

[11:53] Renata Ballesteros : Thank you for the notes, Mary. Very helpful

[11:53] Les : @ Mary: great summaries

[11:53] Martin Dow : @aleeza - I'm afraid I'm ignorant of Trustlines - this: <https://trustlines.network/> ?

[11:53] Mary Fee : Grace asks what are the types of scaffolding that you need to have in place and what do you need to avoid.

[11:54] Aleeza Howitt : @Jakub Actually I've briefly spoken with Dil on this, he's been working on some cool visual stuff... :)

[11:55] Aleeza Howitt : @Martin Yeah, or to try it go to- <https://trustlines.app/>

[11:55] Martin Dow : @Lauren - the term "interoperability" might need some context.. finding a common symbology, pattern?

[11:55] Greg L Gomez : hey folks, would like to invite you all to an Open:2020 afterparty to keep the conversation going after the event today:
<https://pad.riseup.net/p/afterparty>

[11:56] Martin Dow : @Aleeza - thanks!

[11:56] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : Oh - thanks Greg - can people chat via that pad!?

[11:56] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : (i.e. video chat)?

[11:57] Mary Fee : Fernanda says you need to be able to identify what are the real problems that people have and how to make it real. In one town where everyone uses taxis they tried to bring them in - they agreed to accept a percentage then more people were incentivised to join in. But you can't buy a cell phone. The answer is to bring in useful things, but you also have to think outside money,

[11:57] Mothiur Rahman : thanks Fernanda - think "flows" not money

[11:57] Andreas Fletcher - Trustlines : @martin i would be happy to create your first trustline with you

[11:57] Jakub Lanc : @Aleeza: Ah, cool! I saw some glimpses I think, curious to see how it evolves.

[11:58] Greg L Gomez : @oliver, yes, there's a zoom link in there. set up by Naomi

[11:58] matslats : Most groups starting now, can't find software to serve them; they spend huge resources on making an app and an accounting system. Local people need to put all their energy into local relationship building NOT on basic infrastructure. My work is all about trying to supply that infrastructure.

[11:59] Fernanda : For people interested in currency design 'The Commons Engine' released a self paced currency design masterclass at <https://bit.ly/currencyDesign>

[11:59] mike hales : @mary fee Lovely spatial permaculture metaphor, for zones of relationship and trust in LETS

[11:59] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : @greg - why not stay here - in the open source world we own? We will leave this room open for that purpose... maybe replace the zoom link with this one? To join go to: <https://open.coop/mainroom>
Enter your name as per your ticket and the code: 944685

[11:59] Guy James : I think Mary has nailed it with this metaphor!

[12:00] Les : A permaculture design principle is always to obtain a yield. LETS/MC enables us to capture measures of yield

[12:00] mike hales : Managing permaculture regime equivalent to managing the 'ecology' of contributions in LETS

[12:01] Simon Grant : @Martin @Lauren to me, interoperability is about enabling different systems to work together. Of course to allow this, there has to be agreement at some level on ontology.

[12:01] Dil Green : The 'zonal' metaphor is great, I agree

[12:01] Jakub Lanc : Speaking about the flows, it occurs to me having a few diligently mapped "profiles" or patterns of various people's flows (of needs and contributions), could be a good step, but going step further...

...giving people impulse and perhaps "methodology" to explore and map their own patterns and possible flows, could be a self-encouraging and self-reinforcing practice by itself - by engaging in mapping the flows of myself and others, I might discover new channels of

"value", therefore widening the opportunities to buy or contribute...

[12:01] Ferananda : I love it @jakub

[12:02] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : @jakub - listing your offers and wants does this - or are you suggesting more?

[12:02] Ferananda : We can use currencies to keep records of currents

[12:02] mike hales : Time banking . . jons up the "contribution accounting" in the DisCO model <https://wiki.guerrillamediacollective.org/index.php/>

Distributed_Cooperative_Organization_(DisCO)_Governance_Model_V_3.0

[12:02] Susannah Browning : "u speak about decentralization as if we live in a free world .. in hostile political regions and corruption, dominating power will not let u be a champion of change, thats we need to backup real change-agents in these regions with global power. So we have to construct a global coalition ASAP" -yes Wael (and I consider England as a hostile region at this point in time)

[12:02] Jakub Lanc : So perhaps some elementary practice of flow-mapping or "currency design" could be a part of the voluntary curricula for the more enthusiastic people.... and perhaps even have some funds allocated :)

[12:03] Jakub Lanc : By the community

[12:03] Jakub Lanc : *Local community

[12:03] Susannah Browning : yes

[12:03] Julie Collishaw : Agreed re volunteering- the top down approach makes people feel helpless

[12:03] Wael Alsaad : how people using MC paying other costs, like medical insurance, , etc .. ? And does the state look after taxes for money in this system?

[12:03] Susannah Browning : it's a nightmare

[12:04] mike hales : "Economy has invaded almost all of life" (economy=money). Including the zone of CARE WORK - this must be retrieved for the 'moral economy'?

[12:04] Ferananda : For an example of mutual credit backed by food read http://bit.ly/Jooles_unenclosed

[12:04] Greg L Gomez : @oliver, sure can do it here, we didn't want to presume as folks from our collective who didn't buy tickets/attend want to come to the after party.

[12:04] Jakub Lanc : Oli: I think needs and offers is a basic variant of this, but this goes more towards proactive / systematic exploration of what could be possible flows / "polarities to be connected" in my immediate or not even immediate environment...

[12:05] Julie Collishaw : If they permeate local culture they are succeeding

[12:05] Mary Fee : Mary talked about the Permaculture Zones, the house, the garden, the vegetable patch, the orchard an the wild woods. This metaphor applies to exchange systems, the family, the friends, the community currency, sterling trades, and the stock exchange which is dangerous.

[12:05] Jakub Lanc : *this as in this not-yet-articulated idea :)

[12:05] Susannah Browning : the pandemic forces people to meet more of their needs (particularly in relational terms) via a digitally mediated platforms which enable the profit imperative to be inserted. This is a fundamentally neoliberal operation and we need to build an alternative to this process which is very much live atm.

[12:05] Renata Ballesteros : @Fernanda, could you speak to how you see currencies like Jooles interacting with other currencies? Would they be exchangeable with Holo Fuel, for example?

[12:05] Mothiur Rahman : Trustlines is interesting - what would it be like to apply the model b2b, would that support growing a local economy without needing to create an alternative currency?

[12:06] mike hales : Such diversity/particularity/vernacular-focus in this discussion :)) Hoping it will be the same leter today, when we're discussing governance models for digital infrastructure commons - bcos there is no de-facto good model?

[12:07] Mary Fee : Enric talks about social currency creating community - if not, it's more like real money. To be successful it needs to cover many of people's basic needs.... currency is part of a broader system of building an economy.

[12:08] Billy Smith : What about using a local-currency that is backed by the products of a co-operatively-owned infrastructure?

Energy Credits from a co-operatively owned wind-turbine.

[12:08] Albert Tucker : There is a lot of money /resources in the systems we work and live with how do we divert/attract and retain them to support these new modes of social economy?

[12:08] Ferananda : @renata It could. If the interest is there someone would build the infrastructure for it. Its life. One good start is that both are mutual credit and both will be built in holochain which makes a path towards interoperability

[12:09] Renata Ballesteros : Gotcha, thank you

[12:09] Ferananda : That is really good idea @billy -Here is an example of currencies for energy http://bit.ly/Decentralized_energy

[12:09] Mary Fee : Sue Bell talks about how to measure success, how does the food go, the trading and also the connections, what are the criteria, how do I measure that. She wondered about how people measure it. Eg in Bhutan they talk about "happiness". How do I feel in charge of my life to be empowered, how can I live in that kind of environment?

[12:09] Wael Alsaad : a measure for success, is the how we far away from the vision we establish as a community.

[12:09] Albert Tucker : There is a lot of debate and policy discussions re Universal basic Income, how does that sit here?

[12:10] Susannah Browning : The contact and trace app is primarily a means to insert situational technological into society (and get it fundamental) as a component of forthcoming tech infrastructure.

[12:10] Mothiur Rahman : Wales has a Wellbeing of Future Generations Act 2015 which has been learning from Bhutan in terms of implementing the implications of that Act

[12:10] Billy Smith : I've been looking at this from the PoV of crop-growing systems.

[12:10] mike hales : Rather than the conceptualisation of economy/currency/credit etc, the thing I've loving in this present session if the POETRY, the life-story, the biography of communities :)) This is warm, not dry

[12:10] Susannah Browning : *situational awareness tech

[12:10] Aleeza Howitt : @Mothiur Sure. The cool thing about Trustlines is it can even be "b2b2p2p" -- it's an agnostic platform, every different relationship can be interoperable with the rest of the network

[12:11] Billy Smith : Grow enough produce to pay for the infrastructure to grow them.

Once the infrastructure is paid for, then everything after the maintenance costs is profit. :D

[12:11] Martin Dow : @Ferananda - holochain I am hoping will be regarded as more than a technology, but instantiations of a set of patterns and whole-systems approaches. With some commonalities

[12:12] John Waters : Anything that can be measured as scalar (even if as a subjective, fuzzy measure such as eudemony) can be accommodated within the open metrics framework (of which open money is a subset).

[12:12] Billy Smith : "Voluntarist" gloss on corporate exploitation...

Trying to build a world without slavery :D

[12:13] Billy Smith : +1 Enrique :d

[12:13] Martin Dow : @John Waters - I am also very drawn to open money as a workable and non-toxic pattern

[12:13] Billy Smith : :D

[12:14] Renata Ballesteros : @Albert. The way I've imagined it would be a community - produced, resource-based UBI. Took a shot at explaining it here: <https://medium.com/@ballesteros.renata/a-solution-to-everything-41809aefa2e8>

[12:14] Ferananda : Totally agree @martin and Currencies are one of the core ways humanity orchestrates activities at large scales. So changes to currencies are fundamental to changing our unsustainable patterns of behavior. AND in Metacurrency definition currencies are way more than for tradeable wealth but that is a big conversation

[12:14] Billy Smith : Altruism doesn't work so well in a system based upon the Economics of Scarcity

[12:14] Kiki Ogawa : how do we weigh up cost of computing from infrastructure against the benefits of the generated currencies?

[12:14] Mary Fee : Giuseppe says a successful Mutual Credit system is successful if it's real. As well as putting bread on the table it has to enable farmers to work on the land. It is successful if it persists through time. We live in a super stressful environment. In our experience we have only been able to do it if we are not volunteering. We need to have our own bread on the table. As long as work for better fairer agreements between people and the planet, but it takes work and wages, not just volunteerism. This is one of the reasons why money is expensive to get access to. Volunteering isn't going to cut it. In Sardex year after year, it means it's still alive and kicking. The other companies through the network help it stay alive. Companies not running properly will run into trouble even with mutual credit. Altruism is economic suicide. If you want meaningful change you need to exploit the centimetre square that we have to push change forward. Sardex is miracle because we have investors, but they also want returns.

[12:15] Les : @Grace: can we get to the panel's view on next steps

[12:15] Leon : totally agree, we had a local digital currency with 420 independent businesses accepting a local currency, that was much cheaper and 100% more altruistic, however, none of those businesses really cared, as we didnt bring them significantly more revenue

[12:15] mike hales : "People need to be careful of their choices and actions" - that discipline/maturity isn't something (?) to be supplied by agencies and organisations? Or can they facilitate it?

[12:15] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : @Grace: can we get to the panel's view on next steps +1

[12:16] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : How do we (if we can?) make MC ubiquitous?

[12:16] Mary Fee : Matslats says we need more transactions, moire people engaged and more people using the technology, but the question is how many dollars are being replaced, how are we impacting on the mainstream economy.

[12:16] Inez : Completely agree @matslats

[12:16] Grace : Sure, After Mary let's go to questions from the audience-- Oliver's question will be first.

[12:16] Billy Smith : Money is only as good as where you can spend it.

[12:18] Mothiur Rahman : I don't know now whether its about "replacing" the mainstream economy anymore... the climate & ecological emergency means its all going to implode soon and its about whether there are means of localised economies that can keep stable through the chaos from the mainstream implosion... perhaps thats the reason for mutual credit schemes, future proofing against the social risks arising out of climate collapse?

[12:19] Martin Dow : We built <https://b4rn.org.uk> in our region. I don't know whether this fits here. We built fibre infrastructure. It works. No "named currency". But the locus of control of GBP-money moved to the community.

[12:19] Martin Dow : ^^ "intentional money" ?

[12:20] Kiki Ogawa : how do we weigh up cost of computing from infrastructure against the benefits of the generated currencies?

[12:20] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : it was Les' question first ;)

[12:20] Susannah Browning : the current economic situation is going to shoehorn a vast sector of the popn into the universal credit system, it's part of the tech infrastructure (think Serco) that's coming in so organising an alternative is critical in this moment, from this point

[12:20] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : ;)

[12:20] Billy Smith : What about the intentional use of the loopholes that other large entities are already using?

[12:21] Simon Grant : I played an active role in building our <https://b4rn.org.uk/> network too

[12:21] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : Any business in the UK can join OCN now via <https://opencredit.network/>

[12:21] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : incorporated businesses get £500 worth of credit to spend

[12:21] Billy Smith : It means that the financial institutions will be "on your side" as they are benefiting from this mechanic...

[12:21] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : this is up and running using open source software

[12:21] Mary Fee : Mary talked about the problem of clauses in the benefits regulations saying that claimants are not allowed to work, and Timebanks claiming on their website that 'LETS is illegal'. So we need to sort out these legalities to clear the way for Mutual Credit systems to be funded so that they can be run professionally.

[12:21] Ferananda : mutual credit is issued only in the moments when value is actually exchanged, it is not a future-based investment and, as such, is difficult to classify as a security which is the main problem that token face

[12:22] Wael Alsaad : Yes @Mary, we need more Campaigns for progressive GrassRoots-Laws and combine them with kickstarter projects.

[12:22] John Waters : LETS agreements have rarely (if ever) precluded activity that could generally be exploited for profit by third parties - i.e. taxable income. In contrast, 1=1 human time precludes taxable income so is of no interest to the tax or benefit departments. The way the UK government worded the document accommodated timeLETS, however, alongside time banks and time networks, the only restriction being that all activity must be recorded as time "spent" not time mapped on to a per hour wage equivalent.

[12:22] Martin Dow : @Simon Grant - I would welcome a connection specifically on b4rn, if not more. The "what do we do with it now?" question. Some work done here.

[12:22] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : @giuseppe - keen to hear your views on the possibility / difficulties of international trade ...

[12:22] Susannah Browning : network

[12:23] Ferananda : you can back it by assets like energy, food

[12:23] Mary Fee : Matthew said it's now possible to connect up Mutual Credit on a global scale.

[12:23] John Waters : The difference was highlighted by the experience in Blangarw (the origin of the "time network") and the contiguous village Garw in which the LETS members were active but reluctant to record their activity.

[12:23] Guy James : maybe @dil or @matslats could post a link to the videos they did recently explaining how this nested network functions

[12:23] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : TOO LOUD MAT!!

[12:24] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : Turn your mic down -- PLEASE?

[12:24] Billy Smith : In terms of ecology, we each have a global budget of 3 tonnes of CO2 per year

[12:25] Billy Smith : No more than that

[12:25] Mary Fee : Matslats says that because mutual credit currency is not "savable", this helps us go towards a more ecological of the economy.

[12:25] Billy Smith : Carbon-tracking would be one way that a mutual credit system could operate and be able to positively improve climate change

[12:25] Mothiur Rahman : maybe I spend too much time in Extinction Rebellion circles but there is general feeling that deep adaptation is needed now to protect what we can from these

ecological & climate crisis which will lead to social collapse too (think what happens when there is no bread on the table because of harvest collapse) <https://www.resilience.org/stories/2020-06-08/collapse-of-civilisation-is-the-most-likely-outcome-top-climate-scientists/>

[12:26] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : Local first +++++1

[12:27] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : International trade is HARD - and even more so with MC

[12:27] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : due to risks / delivery etc

[12:27] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : and tax

[12:28] Ferananda : In holochain and commons engine we are designing currencies backed by universal human needs. Mutual credit with REA Accounting to track non monetary flows of value. We are helping to launch a food backed currency. Holochain community members also building a mutual credit exchange system etc. We believe in enclosable systems.

[12:28] Dil Green : The YouTube videoa Guy mentioned: https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCEKetCP_CnXGdT4d46bGk8g

[12:28] Mary Fee : Giuseppe says they are working on this with Sardex, ten regions in Italy, various partners, a mix of collaboration and compatibility - it's important to bridge between different localities. The dilemma is how to ensure that any community anywhere has enough to feed itself, to keep itself busy, need energy, food, shelter, these are the questions where we will see huge areas opening up, but we will also see wastelands, the whole society is not a donut, it's an every-climbing nutcase.

[12:28] Trevor Hilder : @ferananda I think you meant unenclosable.

[12:29] Billy Smith : Giuseppe: the technology already exists. :D

[12:29] Ferananda : yes! Thank you... 1:30am for me

[12:29] Guy James : thanks @dil, I recommend people watch them if they want to understand a bit more in depth how a network of MC can scale

[12:29] Wouter @femProcomuns.coop : i hope so indeed , unenclosable :-)

[12:29] Martin Dow : ^^ Trevor Same comment

[12:29] Susannah Browning : Hi Fernanda, I would be interested to find out more about the metrics / indicators used for human needs being used.

[12:29] Mary Fee : Grace says that Giuseppe is running a centralised system - how do we build a decentralised system?

[12:29] Trevor Hilder : @ferananda Thanks for participating at such a time!

[12:30] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : @ferananda Thanks for participating at such a time! +1 ;)

[12:30] Ferananda : :D

[12:30] Billy Smith : Did you know that Visa started off as a b2b co-operative?

[12:30] Grace : Any other audience questions?

[12:31] Cecilie Smith-Christensen : How about developing credit networks as a cooperative from the very beginning; with a voting system designed to also consider the actual participation?

[12:31] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : OCN is (afawk) unique in that it is a Co-op AND uses Open Source software

[12:31] John Waters : @trevor @fernanda Are you referring to unenclosable system or unenclosable carriers? These are not the same.

[12:32] Trevor Hilder : @john waters Good point. Systems need boundaries to be systems at all.

[12:32] Aleeza Howitt : I have a question for the panelists! How do you think mutual credit systems will evolve in the current economic/political climate? Do you think we are nearing a turning point where it will actually start to "move the needle"?

[12:32] Mary Fee : Dil says there are a lot of fully mutual networks, the Open Credit Network looked at Sardex, but briefly what we managed to design was a simple design that every member has a vote, but the management of the scheme is contracted out to a small team. If members don't like it they can vote in a different admin team. That mechanism is not tried and tested, they haven't yet had a crisis, but they've tried to address the issue of

structure.

[12:32] Ferananda : @susannah As example Projects like JOOLES turn these downward-spiral economics on their heads by providing funding needed for growers to tap into new, profitable markets based on high-quality (not just high-quantity) output metrics. For example farmers will have a line of credit that will grow depending on the quality of their soil. JustOne Organics is working with the Bionutrient food association that is developing a hand held device to trace the nutritional value of the food produced.

[12:32] Wael Alsaad : what if we trust each other? do we still need alternative currencies? We have so much abundance and bless that cant be counted!

[12:32] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : can we hear about SCOPE - how big do the panel think MC can get?? what % of the economy could run via MC??

[12:33] matslats : @aleeza I don't think any of us can see the whole system well enough to talk about turning points.

[12:33] John Waters : @trevor That is central to the open metrics / open money model - recursively nested closures (namespaces).

[12:34] Billy Smith : @Wael: you have to design structures to take bad actors into account.

[12:34] Martin Dow : @Wael - valuable question to keep in mind. Avoid a currency "animal farm" perhaps?

[12:34] Ferananda : @aleeza if we can solve real problems then it will grow.

[12:34] Renata Ballesteros : @Fernanda, is this funding provided to the growers in the form of Jooles? Or fiat money? Can they buy supplies with Jooles?

[12:35] Renata Ballesteros : (just trying to wrap my head around the flow)

[12:35] Billy Smith : Nice way of dealing with bad actors...

[12:35] Simon Grant : Metrics: yes I'm interested too. They are powerful -- and can be used for good or bad. I'd like to help ensure that the measurements that are made are genuinely helpful.

[12:35] Trevor Hilder : @wael Metacurrency insight is that a currency is a means of seeing a flow of value. We need different currencies to measure different value flows.

[12:35] Les : I'm struck by the disconnect between this thread and the panel discussion. There are 63 people on the call but no feedback.

[12:35] Billy Smith : There is feedback

[12:35] Ferananda : Farmers will be able to get fiat by selling their seconds (garde b food) to justoneorganics that then they convert into Grade A through their gentle-drying technology

[12:36] Grace : This seems like an incredibly lively chat, Les, I don't agree.

[12:36] Guy James : @aleeza I personally see MC as a local solution, but also as a 'safety net' for when the very fragile default system collapses, so that for me will be the turning point.

[12:36] Mary Fee : Giuseppe says that in Sardex they have always been aware of governance issues, but they are governed by contracts with the members. Also for us, impact is more important than governance. There will be conflicts with 5,000 members, agreements are regularly updated based on feedback from the community. So now there is a "fair usage" policy. If people don't like the rules they can always opt out. They have to pay their balance and there is a debt collection process. We won't get any mainstream adoption if these concepts are not grasped. People are self-employed 90% don't report .

[12:36] Billy Smith : it's just interspersed between the extended conversations. :D

[12:36] Guy James : Thanks Giuseppe, very interesting contributions

[12:36] Wael Alsaad : sure @billy.. we need just the capsule or the uterus surrounding us from them

[12:36] Renata Ballesteros : I'm loving Mary's notes, it really helps to stay in touch regardless of the idea storm

[12:37] Graham : @Guy: local yes, but need for federal networks to deliver broader liquidity?

[12:37] Billy Smith : @wael: also watch for internal bad actors.

[12:38] Guy James : @Graham, yes for sure, federation will increase the resilience

[12:38] John Waters : The "reality" of (fiat) money for most of us lies in its absence. Those with a power advantage relative to us ration the supply of our means of survival, forcing us each into some stratum within a conditioned hierarchy - a pyramid of wage slavery. This is an unfortunate terminal state when the "modalities" of human interaction are not accommodated by currencies of sufficient variety [in Ashby's sense - variety being a rather fuzzy measure of our ability to cope with whatever we need to cope with, in context], neglecting other modalities - "unconditional care", "guardianship" and "learning networks" (using the terms introduced by Trevor Hilder, and ignoring finer nuances). The focus here is on "exchange" modality. It is important to provide structures to retard (and preferably reverse) collapse into "conditioned hierarchy". In my opinion we need high-variety "currencies" to build a Conant-Ashby compliant economy - a hyperstable regulator to maintain homeostasis (in a very broad sense) between planetary upper bounds and human needs (cf. Max-Neef, Maslow, etc). The model here provides a step in the right direction (and may provide a big step in the short term) but is not able to meet the variety needs.

[12:38] Simon Grant : Not clear about Dil saying that alternative currencies need to be free as conventional currency

[12:38] Billy Smith : There are a number of co-ops/mutuals that were shut down and looted by this method

[12:38] Martin Dow : @Billy Smith - "internal bad actors" - right...

[12:38] Leon : Impact is the only thing that matters, if you create behaviour change around a sustainable , inclusive economic , system / model that reaches 80% of people, who cares how it was governed to get there. If great distributed governance creates fantastic outcomes, then great.

[12:38] Mary Fee : Closing round: Dil says "if we wish to build a viable new economy we must provide tools which give people freedom as in the main economy, but also has value creation." - "Capitalism works by providing a pathway, we have to provide a pathway that leads away from the destructive economy (approximately).

[12:39] Albert Tucker : guiseppe's positioning is dependent on system where legal remedies are applied or work well. these also have costs associated when things go wrong

[12:39] Billy Smith : :Martin: there needs to be controls to avoid internal fraud as well as external attacks

[12:39] Wael Alsaad : internal bad actors, have leverage point because the structure allowing that. Socichracy 3.0 is good to go]

[12:40] Mary Fee : Enric says we need the technology to be flexible so that the system can be changed. Decentralised models need to be more flexible and appropriate to human groups.

[12:40] Billy Smith : I saw one housing co-op that nearly shut down, as the Chair and the Secretary ran off with most of the fuds...

[12:40] Billy Smith : *funds

[12:41] Mary Fee : Ferananda says we need to be creative and think beyond wealth, and experiment, with different models - there's a world that mutual credit can do beyond goods & services.

[12:41] Trevor Hilder : @mary fee Thanks indeed for the notes.

[12:41] Billy Smith : The current protective system is slow and bureaucratic, but once you know why it's there, it stops being an issue

[12:41] Renata Ballesteros : Great point, Mat!

[12:41] Wael Alsaad : we can have following structure: 10% of earned MC goes to pool to support projects in the new "extended-decentralized" economy

[12:42] Renata Ballesteros : Let's get using these tools!!

[12:42] Guy James : this is what I mean by creating a safety net. the moment will come

[12:42] Ferananda : Indeed!!! +1 to Matt

[12:42] Mary Fee : Matslats says a lot of us have it in mind that we can create an alternative

that will replace capitalism, but he says capitalism is failing and the best we can do is to be there as it falls, to catch people - that takes the pressure of us, we have to keep on doing our stuff until our moment comes.

[12:42] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : ditto +1 Matt

[12:42] Billy Smith : Not enough spoons :D

[12:42] mike hales : "Be there as capitalism falls, to catch people" - we have to be capable, but not system-changers

[12:43] Billy Smith : Sue: same here ::D

[12:43] Renata Ballesteros : Hopeful is helpful :)

[12:43] Guy James : In our MC network, a lot of people have already been abandoned by capitalism, so in a way this is not a future use-case

[12:43] Billy Smith : "Build a better system, and transition people across one person at a time." :D

[12:43] Ferananda : beautiful @guy

[12:43] Mary Fee : Sue Bell says her reality is that she is neuro-diverse - she is here to capture the enormous wealth and put the jigsaw together in a new way. Not helpful, but hopeful. Conversation she has been hearing over the decades has more clarity, heartfelt but not fantasy-land.

[12:44] mike hales : Need space to digest, to sleep, to let things soak thro - YES. Not everyone leaps into action and moves quickly in 'the flow'. Neurodiverse, pluriversal practice

[12:44] Oliver Sylvester-Bradley : building the MARKETS and networks of businesses that COMMIT to using Mutual credit is the hardest but most crucial task -

[12:44] mike hales : 'The dance'

[12:44] Ferananda : yes! To what Oliver just said

[12:44] Martin Dow : @Billy Smith "Animal Farm"? - thanks

[12:44] Mary Fee : Grace talks about all the different experiences here, and thanks everybody. It was incredibly engaging.

[12:44] Guy James : thanks was very interesting session :)

[12:44] Ferananda : A gift of 20% of the currency design masterclass from metacurrency and commons engine <https://bit.ly/2A1CN7r>

[12:44] Billy Smith : TY

[12:45] Billy Smith : @martin: what do you mean by "Animal Farm"?

[12:45] Aleeza Howitt : Thank you Grace & everyone it was an amazing panel!

[12:45] Mary Fee : Oliver says thankyou to everybody.

[12:45] Ferananda : Thank you all!!! Good night from Maui

[12:46] Renata Ballesteros : Wonderful! Totally worth it waking up at 5:00 for it :D